#### CITYGATE ASSOCIATES, LLC

# FIRE/EMS DEPARTMENT COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONS ASSESSMENT

#### **PROJECT BRIEFING**

#### CITY OF VALDEZ, AK

JUNE 21, 2022



## **Today's Briefing**

- How the study was conducted
- Risk Assessment summary
- Operational workload review
- Staffing system abilities
- Findings and recommendations
- Questions and discussion



## **Scope of Work Performed**

- Electronic incident data and City/Department documentation reviewed
- Internal and external stakeholder interviews
- Comprehensive Community Risk Assessment
- Incident Response Statistical Analysis
  - Service demand and response performance
  - Staffing capacity and response time review



## Scope of Work Performed (cont.)

- Station area coverage and mutual aid analysis
- Headquarters support staffing and organizational assessment
- Multiple progress briefings
- 85-page Final Report evaluating deployment and headquarters services
- 27-page Community Risk Assessment Appendix



### Strengths

- Very committed career and volunteer staff
- The Department is the center of their lives
- Technically competent
- *Excellent* safety and training programs
- Excellent facility, apparatus, tools, and equipment
- Staff feels the pressure of being isolated without deep mutual aid support



## **Risk Assessment**



## **Risk Assessment Methodology**

- Use of geographic planning sub-zones
- Identify/quantify values at risk to be protected
- Identify hazards likely to impact City
- Determine **probability** of a hazard occurrence
  - Based on prior years' service demand by hazard type
- Identify probable impact severity of a hazard occurrence
- Determine **overall risk** by hazard and planning zone



#### Values at Risk

#### • People

- 3,729 residents
- ≈15,000 more during peak fishing and tourism season

#### Buildings

- 1,800 dwelling units
- 300 businesses

#### • Economic Resources

- Port of Valdez
- Valdez Marine Terminal
- Commercial/sport fishing industry



## Values at Risk (cont.)

- 64 high/maximum risk building occupancies
- 61 Critical facilities/infrastructure
- Numerous natural resources
  - Port Valdez
  - Valdez Glacier Lake
  - Lowe River
  - Robe Lake

- Solomon Lake
- Jack Bay
- Jack Bay State Marine Park



#### **Hazards Evaluated**

- **1.** Building Fire
- **2.** Vegetation/Wildfire
- **3.** Medical Emergency
- 4. Hazardous Material Release/Spill
- **5.** Technical Rescue
- 6. Marine Incident
- 7. Aviation Incident



### **Impact Severity Factors**

- Population density
- Building density
- Critical facilities
- Service capacity
- Vehicle traffic
- Hazard mitigation
- Demographics

- High-risk occupancies
- Economic resources
- Natural resources
- Cultural resources
- Water supply
- Historic service demand
- Response performance



#### **Overall Risk Assessment**

	Hazard	<b>Risk Rating</b>		
1	Building Fire	Moderate		
2	Vegetation/Wildfire	Low		
3	Medical Emergency	High		
4	Hazardous Materials	Moderate		
5	Technical Rescue	Moderate		
6	Marine Incident	Moderate		
7	Aviation Incident	Moderate		



CITYGATE ASSPCIATES, LLC

## **Overall Risk Assessment (cont.)**

- In addition to previous hazard assessment, Valdez is at significant risk of a catastrophic event resulting from an earthquake, oil spill, or tsunami due to its:
  - Remoteness
  - Topography
  - -Geology
  - Climate
  - Crude oil industry



#### **Emergency Timeline Targets**





## **Service Demand**



#### Service Demand by Incident Type

#### Number of Incidents by Year by Incident Type





## **Types of Incidents and Properties**

- 466 total incidents in 2020
- Daily demand of **1.27** incidents
  - 1.72% were fire
  - 55.58% were EMS
  - 42.7% were other incident types
- 48% of all incidents occurred in residential dwellings
- Three building fires each in 2018 and 2019; one in 2020
- 3.65% of the incidents occurred while another was underway



#### **Service Demand by Month**

#### Number of Incidents by Month by Year



#### Service Demand by Day of Week

#### Number of Incidents by Day of Week by Year





#### Service Demand by Time of Day



20

#### Demand by Hour of Day (2020)

Hour	1 Mon	2 Tue	3 Wed	4 Thu	5 Fri	6 Sat	7 Sun	Total
00:00	1	2	1	3	2	1	5	15
01:00	3	1	2	0	0	0	0	6
02:00	3	3	4	0	1	2	2	15
03:00	0	1	4	3	3	0	1	12
04:00	1	2	3	0	1	1	3	11
05:00	0	1	0	2	2	0	1	6
06:00	1	0	1	1	1	4	2	10
07:00	5	2	0	3	2	0	0	12
08:00	0	4	3	2	3	1	2	15
09:00	7	3	7	4	6	4	1	32
10:00	5	5	2	1	5	1	0	19
11:00	3	3	2	1	5	4	2	20
12:00	5	4	7	6	3	6	5	36
13:00	0	1	1	8	7	5	2	24
14:00	3	6	4	5	8	2	1	29
15:00	6	1	4	3	6	2	3	25
16:00	2	4	3	8	6	6	6	35
17:00	5	2	4	1	3	9	3	27
18:00	9	4	5	5	10	4	4	41
19:00	2	2	6	1	3	1	1	16
20:00	3	5	2	4	0	4	3	21
21:00	0	3	2	3	1	3	1	13
22:00	1	1	1	2	2	3	2	12
23:00	2	1	3	2	3	1	2	14
Total	67	61	71	68	83	64	52	466



# **Response Performance**



### **Response Time to 90% of Fire & EMS Calls**

Station	2018	2019	2020	Best Practice Suburban
Call to Arrival	12:48	12:22	11:22	11:30
Dispatch Process	1:58	2:28	2:28	1:30
Crew Turnout	-	-	2:18	2:00
Travel Time	8:45	8:01	7:48	8:00

Best practice is based on NFPA 1720 for *combination* departments in suburban areas with a population of 500–1,000 per square mile



## **Call to Arrival by Minute**

#### Fractile for Incidents Call to 1st Arrival





# **Staffing Capacity Review**



### **Volunteer Summary Statistics**

- 24 currently active
  - 11 are age 40 or under
  - 8 are age 40-50
  - 5 are age 50 or over
- 11 (46%) are structure fire-qualified
- 4 (17%) are Driver/Operator-qualified
- 11 (46%) are EMT-qualified



#### **Structure Firefighting Personnel Needed – Residence**

- 15 total personnel including a certified Incident Commander needed:
  - OSHA two-in/two-out fire attack (4)
  - Pump operator (1)
  - Water supply (1)
  - Rescue
  - Utilities/safety/EMS treatment
  - Ventilation
  - Command
- 2 Career + 1 chief + all 11 structure fire volunteers = 14



(2)

(2)

(4)

(1)

#### **Career Plus Volunteers – Structure Fires**



#### CITYGATE ASSSCIATES, LL

#### **Structure Fire-Qualified Volunteers**



90% of *any type* of fire incidents only receive three or fewer firequalified volunteers.



#### **EMS-Qualified Volunteers**

Frequency ······ %



For nearly three quarters of EMS events, no volunteers will respond; less than 7% of incidents have two or more volunteers.

CIIYUtiit



#### **Volunteers on "Other" Incidents**

Volunteer Frequency by Complement Size Excludes Fire & EMS Calls



#### **Volunteer Response by Time and Day**

Hour	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat	Sun
0		1.0			2.0		1.5
1		1.5		1.0	2.0	1.0	
2		1.0	3.0	2.0	1.0		
3			1.0	1.0			
4	1.0			1.5		1.0	2.0
5	1.0			1.0	3.0	1.0	
6	2.0				2.0		
7	1.5	1.0	1.0	2.0	1.0		2.0
8		1.0		0.8	1.8	1.3	1.0
9	0.5	1.0	1.4	0.7	0.7	1.1	1.0
10	1.0	1.0	1.3	1.5	1.3	1.5	1.0
11		1.6	1.0	0.5	1.0	1.7	1.8
12	0.5	1.0	1.1	2.3	1.0	0.7	0.8
13	1.0	1.0		0.9	1.8	1.4	1.8
14	1.0	1.5	1.5	1.0	0.8	1.5	1.6
15	1.0	1.4	1.5	3.0	1.3	1.0	2.5
16	0.6	1.0	1.7	1.3	1.2	2.0	1.1
17	1.5	1.8	1.3	1.5	1.0	1.0	1.2
18	2.0	2.5	1.7	1.0	0.8	1.3	1.5
19	0.9	0.6	2.8	1.7	1.2	1.7	1.5
20	1.3	1.1	1.4	0.7	1.3	1.5	1.3
21	1.5	2.5	1.5	1.0	1.0		1.3
22	4.0	1.5	1.0	1.3	1.5	1.5	
23	2.5	1.2	1.0	1.0	1.0		1.0

Quantities are highest between 7:00 PM and 12:00 AM, and there is need seven days per week.



CITYOHIE HSS<sup>®</sup>CIHIES,

#### **Response by Person – Building Fire-Qualified**

Volunteer	2018	2019	2020	<b>Grand Total</b>
Volunteer 1	4	53	12	69
Volunteer 2	10	19	13	42
Volunteer 3	12	23	5	40
Volunteer 4	11	15	6	32
Volunteer 5	10	13	2	25
Volunteer 6	7	12	2	21
Volunteer 7	7	12	1	20
Volunteer 8	12	6	1	19
Volunteer 9	13	3	1	17
Volunteer 10	-	10	2	12
Volunteer 11	2	7	-	9

Four volunteers are responding to 60% of incidents.



#### **Response by Person – EMS-Qualified**

Volunteer	2018	2019	2020	<b>Grand Total</b>
Volunteer 1	39	53	11	103
Volunteer 2	8	10	23	41
Volunteer 3	12	23	5	40
Volunteer 4	11	15	6	32
Volunteer 5	10	13	2	25
Volunteer 6	7	12	2	21
Volunteer 7	7	12	1	20
Volunteer 8	12	6	1	19
Volunteer 9	13	3	1	17
Volunteer 10	6	4	-	10
Volunteer 11	-	7	-	7

Four volunteers are responding to 64% of the EMS incidents.



## **Volunteer Training Commitment**

- Minimum **370 hours** required for **new** volunteer firefighters
  - Firefighter 1, EMT, and basic hazmat operations
  - State requirement
  - Average of 31 hours per month
    - Nearly four eight-hour days per month, or eight half-days per month
    - *If* there are enough students to schedule, otherwise longer
  - Ongoing monthly training as required by Department



## **Deployment Summary**

- Minimum service level needed 24/7/365
  - Calls for service occur all hours of the day, every day of the week
- Dispatch time to serious incidents needs improvement
- Travel time varies by location; only City core meeting suburban and volunteer agency goals
- Serious incident staffing too dependent on career callback <u>and</u> a few volunteers



### **Risk to Outcome Exposure**

- Even two on-duty personnel cannot handle all EMS events without help
- When the two on-duty staff are out of town with the ambulance, the next emergency is totally dependent on recall of off-duty and volunteers
- Two on-duty personnel cannot perform interior firefighting (two-in/two-out)



### **Risk to Outcome Exposure (cont.)**

- Current staffing is six full-time career personnel (two per shift)
  - Even one lost-time injury drives up overtime costs, AND
  - Adds further strain when others need/want to take normal time off
- Off-duty career and volunteers are not always in town and available for a call
  - Not all volunteers work a traditional 40-hour schedule
  - Too few volunteers to support Department's needs



## **Deployment Recommendation**

- **Goal: Four** immediately available firefighters for building fires or serious EMS emergencies
  - Meets OSHA two-in/two-out requirement
  - If the ambulance is committed, remaining two personnel could respond to a new incident without needing a volunteer driver
  - Minimum number of firefighters needed to initiate a search & rescue or suppression if enough volunteers are not available
  - Reduces backfill burden if an employee is injured or on extended leave



## **Deployment Recommendation (cont.)**

- **Goal: Four** immediately available firefighters for building fires or serious EMS emergencies; options are:
  - 1. Two additional full-time firefighters per shift (six total)
  - 2. One additional full-time firefighter per shift (three total)
    - Or use structure fire-qualified volunteer firefighters on hourly non-benefitted stipend, which would require each volunteer firefighter to work 2.75 24-hour shifts per month, or 5.5 12-hour shifts per month
  - **3. Continue to rely** on volunteer firefighter availability from home/work for the third or fourth firefighter position



# **Headquarters Programs Review**



## **Current Staffing and Programs**

- Current administrative staff to oversee and support all Department programs and responsibilities
  - Fire Chief
  - Administrative Assistant
- No backup or redundancy
- Fire Chief is on-call for incident command 24/7/365 with no backup when he is out of town
- Ambulance fees have not been updated in 15 years
- Very limited local fire prevention program



## **Fire Prevention Program**

- State Fire Marshal's office telling applicants plan checks will take three weeks
  - State Fire Marshal must do complex on-site inspections
- State law mandates state program, with possible local agency exemptions
  - Deferment to local agency requires application and renewal every three years
  - Requires a full program, with Council-adopted ordinance and certified personnel; Council must also commit to enforcing codes



#### **Headquarters Program Recommendation**

- Add a second-in-command Chief Officer
  - Backfill for Fire Chief when absent
  - Manage either training/EMS quality assurance or be credentialed as a Fire Prevention Officer if the City elects to operate a full-service fire prevention program
  - Allows for succession plan training for the next Fire Chief
- Update ambulance fees pursuant to a required study



# **Next Steps**



## **Deployment Next Steps**

- Adopt response time goals tied to risk outcomes
- Increase daily minimum staffing to four firefighters
- **Continue** to support and maintain a volunteer force
- Add an aerial ladder truck
  - After staffing is increased
  - If City can provide maintenance
  - Appropriate apparatus type and size for the City's needs



## **Headquarters Next Steps**

- Add a second Chief Officer for training/quality programs or fire prevention
- Conduct an ambulance fee study to update the City's 15-yearold fee
- Monitor State Fire Marshal plan review and inspection timeliness
  - If severely deficient, bring inspection in-house and contract for plan reviews



# Discussion

